

SME Policy Index

Eastern Partner Countries 2016

ASSESSING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF
THE SMALL BUSINESS ACT FOR EUROPE



Table of contents

Abbreviations and acronyms	15
Executive summary	17
Overview: 2016 Small Business Act assessment of Eastern partner countries	21
Key findings for each policy dimension	22
Key findings for each country	35
References	38
2016 SME Policy Index scores for Eastern partner countries	39
Policy framework and assessment process	45
The SBA assessment framework	46
The assessment process	47
Policy framework: the Eastern Partnership and the Small Business Act for Europe	48
References	51
Economic context and the role of SMEs in the Eastern partner countries	53
A heterogeneous region with a diverse economic structure	53
Regional developments are damaging macroeconomic performance	55
Policy barriers are limiting SME’s potential for economic competitiveness and inclusive growth ...	60
Unleashing the potential of SMEs	63
References	64

Part I

Small Business Act assessment: Findings by SBA dimension

Chapter 1. Entrepreneurial learning and women’s entrepreneurship (Dimension 1) in Eastern partner countries	69
Introduction	70
Assessment framework	70
Analysis	72
The way forward	80
References	81
Chapter 2. Bankruptcy and second chance for SMEs (Dimension 2) in Eastern partner countries ..	83
Introduction	84
Assessment framework	85

Analysis	86
The way forward	92
References	94
Chapter 3. Institutional and regulatory framework for SME policy making (Dimension 3) in Eastern partner countries	97
Introduction	98
Assessment framework	99
Analysis	101
The way forward	109
References	110
Chapter 4. Operational environment for SMEs (Dimension 4) in Eastern partner countries	113
Introduction	114
Assessment framework	115
Analysis	116
The way forward	123
References	123
Chapter 5. Support services for SMEs and start-ups and public procurement (Dimensions 5a and 5b) in Eastern partner countries	125
Dimension 5A: Support services for SMEs and start-ups	126
Introduction	126
Assessment framework	127
Analysis	129
The way forward	133
Dimension 5B: Public procurement	135
Introduction	135
Assessment framework	135
Analysis	136
The way forward	139
References	140
Chapter 6. Access to finance for SMEs (Dimension 6) in Eastern partner countries	141
Introduction	142
Assessment framework	144
Analysis	145
The way forward	153
References	154
Chapter 7. Standards and technical regulations (Dimension 7) in Eastern partner countries	155
Introduction	156
Assessment framework	156
Analysis	157
The way forward	160
References	161
Chapter 8. Enterprise skills and innovation (Dimensions 8a and 8b) in Eastern partner countries	163
Dimension 8a: Enterprise skills	164
Introduction	164
Assessment framework	165

Analysis	167
The way forward	172
Dimension 8b: Innovation policy for SMEs	173
Introduction	173
Assessment framework	174
Analysis	176
The way forward	181
References	182
Chapter 9. SMEs in a green economy (Dimension 9) in Eastern partner countries	185
Introduction	186
Assessment framework	186
Analysis	187
The way forward	190
References	192
Chapter 10. Internationalisation of SMEs (Dimension 10) in Eastern partner countries	193
Introduction	194
Assessment framework	195
Analysis	196
The way forward	202
References	204
Part II	
Small Business Act assessment: Eastern partner country profiles	
Chapter 11. Armenia: Small Business Act country profile	207
Key findings	208
Overview	210
SBA assessment results	213
The way forward	227
References	229
Chapter 12. Azerbaijan: Small Business Act country profile	231
Key findings	232
Overview	234
SBA assessment results	237
The way forward	250
References	252
Chapter 13. Belarus: Small Business Act country profile	253
Key findings	254
Overview	256
SBA assessment results	260
The way forward	273
References	275
Chapter 14. Georgia: Small Business Act country profile	277
Key findings	278
Overview	280
SBA assessment results	283

The way forward	296
References	298
Chapter 15. Republic of Moldova: Small Business Act country profile	301
Key findings	302
Overview	304
SBA assessment results	308
The way forward	321
References	323
Chapter 16. Ukraine: Small Business Act country profile	325
Key findings	326
Overview	328
SBA assessment results	332
The way forward	345
References	348
Annex A. Methodology for the Small Business Act assessment – Technical annex	349
References	356
Annex B. Organisation profiles	357
Figures	
Figure 0.1 Progress towards SME-supportive policies in Eastern partner countries, 2012 and 2016 ..	22
Figure 0.2 GDP growth trends in Eastern partner countries, % year-on-year change, 2010-15	56
Figure 0.3 Inflows of foreign direct investment to EaP countries, 2005-14	57
Figure 0.4 Reliance of EaP countries on Russian trade and remittances, 2012	58
Figure 0.5 Evolution of EaP-EU exports and imports, 2004-14	59
Figure 0.6 Contribution of SMEs to employment and value-added, 2013	60
Figure 0.7 Evolution of small companies' performance in EaP countries, 2009 and 2013	61
Figure 0.8 Evolution of medium-sized companies' performance in EaP countries, 2009 and 2013 ..	61
Figure 1.1 Assessment framework for Dimension 1	71
Figure 1.2 Weighted scores for Dimension 1 compared to 2012	73
Figure 2.1 Assessment framework for Dimension 2	85
Figure 2.2 Weighted scores for Dimension 2 compared to 2012	87
Figure 2.3 Average bankruptcy time (years), 2012 and 2015	90
Figure 2.4 Average bankruptcy cost (% of estate), 2012 and 2015	90
Figure 2.5 Average bankruptcy recovery rate (cents in the dollar), 2012 and 2015	90
Figure 3.1 Assessment framework for Dimension 3	98
Figure 3.2 Weighted scores for Dimension 3 compared to 2012	102
Figure 4.1 Assessment framework for Dimension 4	114
Figure 4.2 Weighted scores for Dimension 4 compared to 2012	116
Figure 4.3 Number of procedures involved in starting a business in EaP countries, 2012-15	119
Figure 4.4 Number of days required to start a business in EaP countries, 2012-15	120
Figure 4.5 Cost of starting a business in EaP countries, 2012-15	120
Figure 4.6 SMEs' use of government websites in EaP countries	122
Figure 5.1 Assessment framework for Dimension 5a	126
Figure 5.2 Weighted scores for Dimension 5a compared to 2012	129
Figure 5.3 Assessment framework for Dimension 5b	136
Figure 5.4 Weighted scores for Dimension 5b compared to 2012	137
Figure 6.1 Perceived obstacles to businesses in Belarus, Moldova and Ukraine (BEEPS V)	143
Figure 6.2 Perceived obstacles to businesses in Armenia, Azerbaijan and Georgia (BEEPS V)	143
Figure 6.3 Assessment framework for Dimension 6	144

Figure 6.4	Weighted scores for Dimension 6	145
Figure 6.5	Share of discouraged firms in all firms not applying for a loan	149
Figure 6.6	Reasons discouraged firms do not apply for a loan	149
Figure 7.1	Assessment framework for Dimension 7	157
Figure 7.2	Weighted scores for Dimension 7 compared to 2012	157
Figure 8.1	Assessment framework for Dimension 8a	165
Figure 8.2	Weighted scores for Dimension 8a compared to 2012	168
Figure 8.3	Assessment framework for Dimension 8b	174
Figure 8.4	Innovation activity in SMEs versus large firms, 2010-12	177
Figure 8.5	Weighted scores for Dimension 8b compared to 2012	177
Figure 9.1	Assessment framework for Dimension 9	186
Figure 9.2	Share of SMEs receiving support for resource efficiency	188
Figure 9.3	Weighted scores for the Dimension 9 compared to 2012	189
Figure 10.1	Assessment framework for Dimension 10	195
Figure 10.3	SME exports in the EaP region are declining, 2002-13	196
Figure 10.4	Share of export-oriented SMEs is declining in the EaP region, 2002-13	197
Figure 10.2	Weighted scores for Dimension 10 compared to 2012	197
Figure 11.1	SBA scores for Armenia	208
Figure 11.2	Business demography indicators in Armenia, 2012	213
Figure 12.1	SBA scores for Azerbaijan	232
Figure 12.2	Business demography indicators in Azerbaijan, 2013	237
Figure 12.3	Sectoral distribution of SMEs in Azerbaijan, 2013	237
Figure 13.1	SBA scores for Belarus	254
Figure 13.2	Business demography indicators in Belarus, 2013	259
Figure 13.3	Sectoral distribution of SMEs in Belarus, 2013	259
Figure 14.1	SBA scores for Georgia	278
Figure 14.2	Business demography indicators in Georgia, 2013	283
Figure 14.3	Sectoral distribution of SMEs in Georgia, 2013	283
Figure 15.1	SBA scores for Moldova	302
Figure 15.2	Business demography indicators in Moldova, 2013	307
Figure 15.3	Sectoral distribution of SMEs in Moldova, 2013	307
Figure 16.1	SBA scores for Ukraine	326
Figure 16.2	Business demography indicators in Ukraine, 2013	331
Figure 16.3	Sectoral distribution of SMEs in Ukraine, 2013	332
Figure A.1	Questionnaire scoring	351

Tables

Table 0.1	Progress in Dimension 1: Entrepreneurial learning and women's entrepreneurship	23
Table 0.2	Progress in Dimension 2: Bankruptcy and second chance for SMEs	24
Table 0.3	Progress in Dimension 3: Regulatory framework for SME policy making	25
Table 0.4	Progress in Dimension 4: Operational environment for SMEs	26
Table 0.5	Progress in Dimension 5a: Support services for SMEs and start-ups	27
Table 0.6	Progress in Dimension 5b: Public procurement	28
Table 0.7	Progress in Dimension 6: Access to finance for SMEs	29
Table 0.8	Progress in Dimension 7: Standards and technical regulations	30
Table 0.9	Progress in Dimension 8a: Enterprise skills	30
Table 0.10	Progress in Dimension 8b: Innovation	32
Table 0.11	Progress in Dimension 9: SMEs in a green economy	32
Table 0.12	Progress in Dimension 10: Internationalisation of SMEs	33
Table 0.13	Summary of regional progress in SME policy development	34
Table 0.14	Summary of country progress and remaining challenges for each SBA dimension	34
Table 0.15	Overview of Armenia's key reforms and recommendations	35
Table 0.16	Overview of Azerbaijan's key reforms and recommendations	35
Table 0.17	Overview of Belarus' key reforms and recommendations	36
Table 0.18	Overview of Georgia's key reforms and recommendations	36

Table 0.19	Overview of Moldova’s key reforms and recommendations	37
Table 0.20	Overview of Ukraine’s key reforms and recommendations	37
Table 0.21	Policy development scale	39
Table 0.22	SME Policy Index scores	40
Table 0.23	The SBA assessment framework and its links to the Small Business Act principles	46
Table 0.24	Key data for the Eastern partner countries, 2014	54
Table 0.25	Key macroeconomic indicators for Eastern partner countries, 2014	56
Table 0.26	Main business constraints in EaP countries, 2013	62
Table 1.1	Scores for Dimension 1: Entrepreneurial learning and women’s entrepreneurship	79
Table 1.2	Dimension 1: Challenges and policy instruments	81
Table 2.1	Scores for Dimension 2: Bankruptcy and second chance for SMEs, 2016	92
Table 2.2	Dimension 2: Challenges and policy instruments	93
Table 3.1	EaP and EU SME definitions	104
Table 3.2	SME statistics collected in the EaP countries	106
Table 3.3	Scores for sub-dimension 3.1: Institutional framework	106
Table 3.4	Scores for sub-dimension 3.2: Legislative simplification and regulatory impact analysis	107
Table 3.5	Scores for sub-dimension 3.3: Public-private consultations	108
Table 4.1	Ease of obtaining a registration certificate in EaP countries	118
Table 4.2	Scores for sub-dimension 4.1: Company registration	121
Table 4.3	Scores for sub-dimension 4.2: Interaction with government services (e-government)	123
Table 5.1	Scores for sub-dimension 5a.1: SME support services provided by the government	132
Table 5.2	Scores for sub-dimension 5a.2: Government initiatives aiming at stimulation of private business support services development	133
Table 5.3	Dimension 5a: Challenges and policy instruments	134
Table 5.4	Scores for Dimension 5b: Public procurement	139
Table 5.5	Dimension 5b: Challenges and policy instruments	139
Table 6.1	Scores for sub-dimension 6.1: Legal and regulatory framework	148
Table 6.2	Banking sector indicators	148
Table 6.3	Scores for sub-dimension 6.2: Bank financing	148
Table 6.4	Scores for sub-dimension 6.3: Non-bank financing	151
Table 6.5	Scores for sub-dimension 6.4: Venture capital	152
Table 6.6	Scores for sub-dimension 6.5: Financial literacy	153
Table 6.7	Dimension 6: Challenges and policy instruments	154
Table 7.1	Scores for Dimension 7: Standards and technical regulations	158
Table 7.2	Dimension 7: Challenges and policy instruments	161
Table 8.1	Scores for Dimension 8a: Enterprise skills	172
Table 8.2	Dimension 8a: Challenges and policy instruments	172
Table 8.3	Scores for sub-dimension 8.1: Policy framework for innovation	179
Table 8.4	Scores for sub-dimension 8.2: Government institutional support services for innovative SMEs	179
Table 8.5	Scores for sub-dimension 8.3: Government financial support services for innovative SMEs	181
Table 8.6	Dimension 8b: Challenges and policy instruments	182
Table 9.1	Scores for sub-dimension 9.1: Environmental policies targeting SMEs	189
Table 9.2	Scores for sub-dimension 9.2: Incentives and instruments	190
Table 9.3	Dimension 9: Challenges and policy instruments	191
Table 10.1	Scores for sub-dimension 10.1: Export promotion	199
Table 10.2	Scores for sub-dimension 10.2: Integration of SMEs into global value chains	200
Table 10.3	Dimension 10: Challenges and policy instruments	203
Table 11.1	Armenia: Challenges and opportunities	209
Table 11.2	Armenia: Main macroeconomic indicators, 2010-14	211
Table 11.3	Definition of micro, small and medium enterprises in Armenia	212
Table 11.4	Armenia: Roadmap for policy reforms	228
Table 12.1	Azerbaijan: Challenges and opportunities	233
Table 12.2	Azerbaijan: Main macroeconomic indicators, 2010-15	235
Table 12.3	Definitions of small and medium enterprises in Azerbaijan	236

Table 12.4	Azerbaijan: Roadmap for policy reforms	251
Table 13.1	Belarus: Challenges and opportunities	255
Table 13.2	Belarus: Main macroeconomic indicators, 2010-15	257
Table 13.3	Definition of micro, small and medium enterprises in Belarus	258
Table 13.4	Belarus: Roadmap for policy reforms	274
Table 14.1	Georgia: Challenges and opportunities	279
Table 14.2	Georgia: Main macroeconomic indicators, 2010-15	281
Table 14.3	Definitions of micro, small and medium enterprises in Georgia	282
Table 14.4	Georgia: Roadmap for policy reforms	297
Table 15.1	Moldova: Challenges and opportunities	304
Table 15.2	Moldova: Main macroeconomic indicators, 2012-15	305
Table 15.3	Definition of micro, small and medium enterprises in Moldova	306
Table 15.4	Moldova: Roadmap for policy reforms	322
Table 16.1	Ukraine: Challenges and opportunities	328
Table 16.2	Ukraine: Main macroeconomic indicators, 2010-15	329
Table 16.3	Definition of micro, small and medium enterprises in Ukraine	331
Table 16.4	Ukraine: Roadmap for policy reforms	347
Table A.1	Example of thematic blocks for the “Institutional framework” sub-dimension	351
Table A.2	Overview of changes to SBA assessment dimensions	352
Table A.3	BEEPS V in the EaP countries	354
Table A.4	Company survey design	355

Boxes

Box 0.1	Scoring SME policy development	39
Box 0.2	COSME	50
Box 0.3	Economic snapshot of the EaP countries	54
Box 1.1	Entrepreneurial learning in Moldova	74
Box 1.2	Building intelligence on women’s entrepreneurship in Azerbaijan	78
Box 2.1	Moldova’s reforms of the insolvency legal framework	89
Box 2.2	Supporting a second chance in the EU	91
Box 2.3	SME views on second chance in the EaP	92
Box 3.1	Georgia’s SME Development Strategy	102
Box 3.2	Denmark’s Business Forum for Better Regulation	108
Box 4.1	Georgia’s Public Service Hall	117
Box 4.2	Azerbaijan’s e-government portal	121
Box 5.1	The UK’s Growth Accelerator	128
Box 5.2	Business support services provided by Armenia’s SME DNC	131
Box 5.3	What are SMEs’ views on public procurement in EaP countries?	137
Box 5.4	Efficiency and transparency in Georgia’s e-procurement system	138
Box 6.1	KredEx: a credit guarantee scheme in Estonia	150
Box 7.1	Ukraine’s standards and technical regulations reforms	159
Box 8.1	Young business people in Belarus are driving the internationalisation of SMEs.	171
Box 8.2	EXIST Transfer of Research programme in Germany	175
Box 8.3	Financial support for innovation in Belarus	180
Box 9.1	Enterprise Ireland’s Green Offer for SMEs	190
Box 10.1	Exports by SMEs are declining in EaP countries	196
Box 10.2	Armenia’s Export Insurance Agency	199
Box 10.3	Creating SME-multinational enterprise linkages in the Czech Republic	201
Box 10.4	The European Union’s DCFTA facility for SMEs	202
Box A.1	What’s new in the 2016 methodology?	350
Box A.2	BEEPS	353
Box A.3	OECD company surveys	354
Box B.1	The Eastern Partnership	358