

1W/700096(039)

CATHERINE DUPRÉ



THE AGE OF DIGNITY

Human Rights and
Constitutionalism
in Europe

BLOOMSBURY

Short Table of Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>Full Table of Contents</i>	xi
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xv
1. Introduction	1
2. We are Not Born in Dignity	28
3. The Foundations of European Constitutionalism: 1949, 1989, 2009	53
4. Human Dignity: A Judge-Made Concept	82
5. Hidden in Plain View: Workers' Human Dignity	113
6. Defining Dignity, Protecting Human Time	141
7. Re-Thinking European Constitutionalism: Dignity, Humanism, Democracy	171
8. Conclusion	194
<i>Bibliography</i>	199
<i>Index</i>	229

Full Table of Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>Short Table of Contents</i>	ix
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xv

1. Introduction.....	1
I. The Rise of Dignity	1
II. Positioning Human Dignity at the Heart of European Constitutionalism.....	4
A. European Constitutionalism: An Equilibrium of Sovereignty	5
B. Comparison: Mapping the Dignity Archipelago	8
C. Constructing a Narrative.....	13
III. Human Dignity as a Constitutional Concept.....	15
A. A Heuristic Concept	16
B. A Secular Concept.....	18
C. Human Dignity as <i>Res Publica</i>	21
IV. The Age of Dignity.....	23
A. Origins, Contexts and Complexities (1789–2009).....	24
B. Human Dignity, Constitutionalism and Democracy.....	25
2. We are Not Born in Dignity	28
I. Introduction.....	28
II. Human Dignity as Ideal	30
A. Freedom	31
B. Autonomy	33
C. Equality.....	37
III. 1789: From Dignities to Dignity.....	38
A. The Spirit of Dignity.....	39
B. Constitutionalism as the Cradle of Human Dignity	41
IV. Dignity as Humanity.....	43
A. Man: Equality, Relationality and Abstraction.....	43
B. Citizen: Dignity as Sovereignty	46
C. Worker: Dignity as Self-Determination and Social Justice.....	47
V. Conclusion.....	50

3. The Foundations of European Constitutionalism:	
1949, 1989, 2009	53
I. Introduction	53
II. Making Sense of the Past.....	57
A. ‘Never Again’	58
B. Filtering the Past.....	62
C. Constructing Temporal Boundaries	63
III. Human Dignity as Constitutional Foundation.....	66
A. The Promise of Dignity.....	66
B. Dignity as a Source of Constitutional Rights	70
IV. Normative Definition of Human Dignity.....	74
A. A Constellation of Core Prohibitions.....	75
B. Embracing Humanity	77
V. Conclusion	80
4. Human Dignity: A Judge-Made Concept	82
I. Introduction	82
II. Endorsing and Re-Activating the Foundational Promise.....	84
A. Significance of Human Dignity Case Law	85
B. Endorsing Human Dignity.....	87
III. Making Human Dignity European	91
A. A Network of Constitutional Courts	91
B. Interlocking Human Dignity.....	94
IV. The Essence of European Constitutionalism.....	99
A. Civilisation, Rule of Law and Consent to Sex.....	99
B. Core Issues of Dignity and of Constitutionalism.....	103
i. Welfare.....	103
ii. Workers’ Self-Determination	106
iii. Defining Humanity.....	107
iv. Setting the Boundaries of Capitalism.....	108
v. Protecting Asylum-Seekers.....	110
V. Conclusion	112
5. Hidden in Plain View: Workers’ Human Dignity.....	113
I. Introduction	113
II. Workers are Human Beings.....	115
A. Work and Constitutionalism: Converging Parallels.....	116
B. Structuring Features of Workers’ Humanity	120
III. Constructing Workers’ Dignity:	
The EU Charter as a Basis.....	125
A. Inviolability of Workers’ Dignity	126
B. Human(e) Working Conditions	128
C. Solidarity and the Pursuit of Social Justice.....	131

IV. Workers' Dignity and Democracy	133
A. Significance of Protection at Constitutional Level.....	134
B. Workers' Rights and Liberal Democracy	135
C. Human Rights and Workers' Rights: A Shared Dynamic of Emancipation.....	138
V. Conclusion.....	139
6. Defining Dignity, Protecting Human Time.....	141
I. Introduction	141
II. Constitutional Time Overflows	144
A. Human Time as Fragmented Plurality	145
B. Constitutional Time Without Direction	148
III. Human Dignity as Human Time	151
A. Human Dignity as Time of One's Own.....	151
B. <i>Kairos</i> of Human Rights.....	157
IV. Protecting Human Time	160
A. Human Dignity as Synchrony.....	161
B. Human Dignity as a Compass Towards Modernity	165
V. Conclusion.....	170
7. Re-Thinking European Constitutionalism: Dignity, Humanism, Democracy	171
I. Introduction	171
II. Constitutionalism as Humanism	172
A. Constitutional Humanity: More than Life and Citizenship.....	173
B. Protecting Humanity: Identity and Purpose of European Constitutionalism.....	176
C. The ECHR as Nexus of European Constitutionalism	179
III. Dignity-Democracy	182
A. A Particular Construction of Time.....	183
B. Constitutional Courts and their Democratic Legitimacy.....	185
C. Binding Constitution-Makers	189
IV. Conclusion	193
8. Conclusion.....	194
<i>Bibliography</i>	199
<i>Index</i>	229

Table of Cases

Chronological Order

European Court of Human Rights

Niemietz v Germany, 16 December 1992 (Application no 72/1991/324/396).....	118, 124, 130
SW v United Kingdom, 22 November 1995 (Application no 20166/92).....	3, 99, 100–1, 162, 168, 174
McCann and others v United Kingdom, 27 September 1995 (Application no 18984/91)	64, 174
D v United Kingdom, 21 April 1997 (Application no 146/1996/767/964).....	163
Selmouni v France, 28 July 1999 (Application no 25803/94)	64–5
Keenan v United Kingdom, 3 April 2001 (Application no 27229/95).....	159
Pretty v United Kingdom, 29 April 2002 (Application no 2346/02).....	96, 101–2, 159, 174
Rantsev v Cyprus and Russia, 7 January 2004 (Application no 25965/04).....	121, 128, 138
Vo v France, 8 July 2004 (Application no 53924/00)	145, 175
Sidabras and Džiautas v Lithuania, 27 October 2004 (Applications nos 55480/00 and 59330/00).....	124
Siliadin v France, 26 October 2005 (Application no 73316/01).....	64, 122, 128, 135
Campagnano v Italy, 3 July 2006 (Application no 77955/01).....	130
Tremblay v France, 11 December 2007 (Application no 37194/02).....	119
MSS v Belgium and Greece, Gd Chamber, 21 January 2011 (Application no 30696/09)	110, 139
MS v United Kingdom, 3 August 2012 (Application no 24527/08).....	153, 159
Vinter and others v United Kingdom, Gd Chamber, 9 July 2013 (Applications nos 66069/09, 130/10 and 3896/10).....	96, 163–4
McDonald v United Kingdom, 20 May 2014 (Application no 4241/12)	153
Hutchinson v United Kingdom, 3 February 2015 (Application no 57592/08)	69, 98, 164–5
Lambert and others v France, 5 June 2015 (Application no 46043/14).....	146, 159

ECJ/CJEU

Hoekstra v Bedrijfsvereniging Detailhandel, Case C-75/63, 19 March 1964.....	119
Stauder v City of Ulm, Case C-29/69, 12 November 1969.....	93, 95
Deborah Lawrie-Blum v Land Baden-Württemberg, Case 66/85, 3 July 1986.....	119
P v S and Cornwall County Council, Case C-13/94, 30 April 1996.....	96
Kingdom of the Netherlands v European Parliament, Case C-377/98, 9 October 2001.....	74, 95–6
KB v National Health Service Pensions Agency and Secretary of State for Health, Case C-117/01, 7 January 2004.....	96
Debra Allonby v Accrington & Rossendale College, Case C-256/01, 13 January 2004.....	119
Michel Trojani v Centre Public d'Aide Sociale de Bruxelles, Gd Chamber, Case C-456/02, 7 September 2004.....	119
Omega Spielhallen-und Automatenaufstellungs-GmbH v Oberbürgermeisterin der Bundestadt Bonn, Case C-36/02, 14 October 2004.....	74, 95, 108, 118
Laval un Partneri v Svenska Byggnadsarbetareförbundet, Case C-341/05, 18 December 2007.....	109
International Transport Workers' Federation and Finnish Seamen's Union v Viking Line ABP and OÜ Viking Line Esti, Gd Chamber, Case C-438/05, 18 December 2007.....	109
Brüstle v Greenpeace eV, Case C-34/10, 18 October 2011.....	108
NS v Secretary of State for the Home Department (Case C-411/10) joined with ME, ASM, MT, KP, EH v Refugee Applications Commissioner, Minister for Justice, Equality and Law Reform (Case C-493/10), 21 December 2011.....	83, 110, 139
Cimade and GISTI v Ministre de l'intérieur, de l'outre-mer, des collectivités territoriales et de l'immigration, Case C-179/11, 27 September 2012.....	111
Thomas Pringle v Government of Ireland and the Attorney General, Case C-370/12, 27 November 2012.....	110, 150
Federal agentschap voor de opvang asielzoekers v Selver Saciri et al, Case C-79/13, 27 February 2014.....	111
A, B, C v Staatssecretaris van Veiligheid en Justitie, Cases C-148/13 to C-150/13, 2 December 2014.....	111

German Federal Constitutional Court

BVerfGE 1, 97 (19 December 1951), on war widows.....	103–4
BVerfGE 2, 1 (23 October 1952), ban of the Socialist Reich Party.....	59
BVerfGE 5, 85 (17 August 1956), ban of Communist Party of Germany.....	60

BVerfGE 27, 1 [6] (16 June 1969), Microcensus case 36, 60
 BVerfGE 45, 187 [228] (21 June 1977), life imprisonment..... 36

France

Conseil Constitutionnel
 Constitutional Council, 27 July 1994, No 94/343/344 DC 87, 107, 168

Conseil d’Etat
 Ass, October 27, 1995, Cne de Morsang sur Orge
 (1995) Dalloz, Jur, 257 119

UK

House of Lords/Supreme Court
 Airedale NHS Trust v Bland, [1993] AC 789 89
 Ghaidan v Godin-Mendoza (FC) 21 June 2004, [2004] UKHL 30 102
 R (on the application of Adam) v Secretary of State for
 the Home Department, R (on the application of Limbuela) v
 Secretary of State for the Home Department, R (on the
 application of Tesema) v Secretary of State for the Home
 Department, House of Lords, 3 November 2005 104–5
 R (on the application of McDonald) (Appellant) v Royal
 Borough of Kensington and Chelsea (Respondent),
 6 July 2011, [2011] UKSC 33 153
 R v Ian McLoughlin and R v Lee William Newell,
 18 February 2014, [2014] EWCA Crim 188 98, 164

High Court
 R (on the application of (1)A and (2) B (By their litigation
 friend the official solicitor) (3)X (4)Y) v East Sussex
 County Council of 18 February 2003 89, 101

Ireland—High Court
 PP v Health Service Executive, of 26 December 2014, No 10792P 159