

1H//650005(039)

Académie de droit international de La Haye

The Hague Academy of International law

Publié sous le direction/Edited by
Maarit Jänterä-Jareborg
Hélène Tigroudja

**Women's Human Rights
and the Elimination of Discrimination**

**Les droits des femmes
et l'élimination de la discrimination**

BRILL | NIJHOFF



TABLE DES MATIÈRES – CONTENTS

Introduction	
Les rapports des directeurs d'études	1
Introduction	
The Reports of the Directors of Studies	1

Chapitre 1 – Chapter 1

WOMEN'S HUMAN RIGHTS: INTERNATIONAL LAW IN THE INTERSECTIONS BETWEEN SOCIOECONOMIC CONDITIONS, CULTURE, TRADITION AND RELIGION	3
Section 1. Introduction	3
Para. 1. The continued topicality of women's human rights and discrimination	3
Para. 2. Successful concepts but with limited practical impact?	9
Para. 3. New tensions and challenges	12
Para. 4. Thematic approaches to women's rights	15
Para. 5. The CEDAW as women's bill of human rights	17
Para. 6. The feminist critique of the CEDAW – and later developments	20
Section 2. Women's societal position in the early twenty-first century.	29
Para. 1. The impact of culture, tradition and religion	29
Para. 2. Poverty of women.	31
Para. 3. Inequality within the family.	34
Para. 4. Gender-specific violence	38
A. Trafficking in women	39
B. Domestic violence	40
C. Men's and societies' "needs" of controlling women	41
D. Child marriages	43
Section 3. Approaching women's rights – conceptualizations in the women's human rights discourse	44
Para. 1. Terminology	44
A. The concepts of equality and discrimination	44
B. Gender and gender-mainstreaming	47
C. The public-private divide	50
D. Further issues	54
Para. 2. Human rights for whom?	54
Section 4. Women's rights and role within the family	60
Para. 1. The universal equality of rights within the family.	60
Para. 2. The role of culture, traditions and religion	62
Para. 3. Culture and faith-based reservations to the CEDAW	68
Para. 4. Concerns of private international law	73
A. Localization in the spirit of internationality	73
B. Protection of fundamental values, national and international	73
C. Compliance with the CEDAW standard?	76
D. Human rights and the toleration of differences	79
Section 5. On the topics from the anglophone group.	82
Para. 1. The added value of the feminist critique to international law	82
Para. 2. Gender's relevance from birth to grave	82
Para. 3. The cross-border mobility of domestic violence	83
Para. 4. Gendered economic inequalities in intimate relationships	85

Para. 5. The cultural preference for boys	86
A. Imbalances in sex ratios – the case of India	86
B. Inter-country adoption of girls – the case of China	87
Para. 6. Cross-border surrogacy arrangements – empowerment or exploitation of women?	89
Para. 7. Gendered parental responsibilities – the case of Islam	95
Section 6. Final note	97
 <i>Chapitre 2 – Chapter 2</i>	
DROITS DES FEMMES ET NON-DISCRIMINATION: DE L’AFFIRMATION DES OBLIGATIONS INTERNATIONALES DE L’ÉTAT À UN DROIT À L’AUTOPROTECTION.	99
Section 1. Introduction	99
Section 2. Les femmes, des hommes comme les autres?	111
Par. 1. L’élaboration d’un «droit international des femmes» autour de la CEDAW	112
Par. 2. Les initiatives régionales en matière de droits des femmes.	119
Section 3. La non-discrimination à l’égard des femmes, règle universelle voire impérative du droit international	123
Par. 1. Le statut international de la règle prohibitive.	123
Par. 2. La pratique étatique et internationale variable voire contraire à la règle de prohibition	127
Section 4. Les multiples manifestations de la discrimination à l’égard des femmes: la persistance d’un «continuum» de discriminations à l’égard des femmes	130
Section 5. Les multiples facteurs de la discrimination à l’égard des femmes.	134
Par. 1. La nécessité d’une approche intersectionnelle des discriminations à l’égard des femmes	135
Par. 2. L’émergence d’un facteur essentiel de la discrimination à l’égard des femmes: les stéréotypes	137
Section 6. Les réponses du droit international contemporain.	139
Par. 1. La prise en compte croissante des «expériences féminines» par le droit international des droits de l’homme et le droit international pénal	139
Par. 2. Les défis à la lutte internationale efficace contre les discriminations à l’égard des femmes.	143
Section 7. Remarques conclusives – Vers l’affirmation d’un droit à l’auto-protection?	148
 Première partie	
Analyse du cadre juridique des droits des femmes	151
 Part I	
Approaching the legal framework of women’s human rights	151
 <i>Chapitre 3 – Chapter 3</i>	
THE COSTS OF (PARTIAL) INCLUSION: THE EVOLUTION, LIMITS AND BIASES OF THE PRINCIPAL FEMINIST CHALLENGES TO INTERNATIONAL LAW	153
Section 1. Introduction	153
Section 2. The essence of the feminist challenge to law	155

Section 3. The evolution of the three principal feminist challenges to international law	158
Para. 1. The conceptual challenge	158
Para. 2. The procedural challenge	166
Para. 3. The substantive challenge	169
Section 4. Gender mainstreaming and the costs of (partial) inclusion	173
Para. 1. The rise of gender mainstreaming	173
Para. 2. The costs of (partial) inclusion	176
Section 5. Conclusion – too much feminism or not enough?	180

Chapitre 4 – Chapter 4

GENDER INJUSTICE, DISCRIMINATION AND THE CEDAW: A WOMEN'S LIFE COURSE PERSPECTIVE.	183
Section 1. Introduction	183
Section 2. The concept of discrimination and equality under CEDAW	186
Section 3. Gender injustice, violence and discrimination against women	190
Para. 1. Violence against women	190
Para. 2. Violations of human rights based on gender stereotypes and convictions of women's inferiority: a life course perspective	194
A. Childhood	194
B. Adolescence and youth.	195
C. Adulthood	198
D. Senior years +65	200
Para. 3. Interdependencies	202
Section 4. The CEDAW's approach to eliminate discrimination.	204
Para. 1. Eliminating discrimination in existing laws, custom and practice by public and private actors	205
Para. 2. Improving the <i>de facto</i> position of women through policies and programmes	208
Para. 3. Tackling underlying causes for discrimination: combating harmful gender stereotypes	210
Para. 4. Discrimination, transformative equality and justice	212
Section 5. Conclusion	215

Chapitre 5 – Chapter 5

FEMMES ET DROIT INTERNATIONAL DES RÉFUGIÉS: LA DÉFINITION DU REFUGIÉ RENOUVELÉE	217
Section 1. Introduction	217
Section 2. La définition du réfugié enrichie: l'intégration des persécutions de genre	226
Par. 1. Les droits de l'homme, source «revitalisante» de la Convention de Genève	226
A. La définition du réfugié revisitée.	226
B. La promotion d'une lecture genrée des motifs conventionnels.	230
Par. 2. Les droits de l'homme, source «oubliée» de la Convention de Genève.	233
A. Débat relatif à la protection d'une assignation ontique c. ontologique	233
B. Une intégration des persécutions de genre en demi-teinte	238

Section 3. Policing the boundaries of “private” and “public”	400
Section 4. Universal norms, local contexts: CEDAW and the diversity of matrimonial property systems	405
Section 5. Intersecting family laws, intersecting gender systems: the case of Mahr.	411
Section 6. Conclusions: legitimacy through discourse translation	416

Chapitre 10 – Chapter 10

LA LUTTE INTERNATIONALE CONTRE LES STÉRÉOTYPES DE GENRE ET LA «CULTURE DE DISCRIMINATION»	421
Section 1. Introduction	422
Section 2. De l’identification des stéréotypes de genre en droit international	427
Par. 1. Le concept de stéréotypes de genre: un instrument de discrimination à l’égard des femmes	428
A. La délimitation de la notion de stéréotypes de genre.	428
B. La délimitation des discriminations découlant des stéréotypes de genre	435
Par. 2. Bannir les stéréotypes de genre sur la base du droit international	437
A. La reconnaissance des stéréotypes de genre à la lumière de l’article 5 CEDAW	438
B. La reconnaissance des stéréotypes de genre en dehors de la CEDAW	442
Section 3. La mise en œuvre de la lutte internationale contre les stéréotypes de genre	447
Par. 1. L’apport de la lutte internationale contre les stéréotypes de genre.	447
A. La théorie de l’approche «anti-stéréotypes».	448
B. La mise en pratique de l’approche «anti-stéréotypes».	452
Par. 2. Les obstacles face à la lutte internationale contre les stéréotypes de genre	459
A. Les obstacles au niveau juridique	459
B. Les obstacles au niveau politique et socio-économique	461

Chapitre 11 – Chapter 11

IMPROVING WOMEN’S RIGHTS THROUGH CHILDREN’S RIGHTS? THE REFORM OF CUSTODY LAWS IN CONTEMPORARY MUSLIM JURISDICTIONS	465
Section 1. Introduction	465
Section 2. Parental care in traditional Islamic jurisprudence	467
Section 3. Custody laws in the age of codification	472
Section 4. The influence of international children’s rights regimes.	476
Section 5. Legal reforms and new approaches to custody	481
Para. 1. Judicial approaches to custody reforms	481
Para. 2. Statutory approaches to custody reforms	484
A. Extending the duration of female custody	484
B. Promoting the best interests of the child	486
Section 6. Summary and outlook.	488

Troisième partie

L'impact du genre sur le respect du droit à la santé, à l'intégrité, aux droits reproductifs et au droit à la vie . . . 491

Part III

The impact of gender with respect to the right to health, integrity, reproduction and the right to life 491

Chapitre 12 – Chapter 12

L'INTERDICTION DE LA VIOLENCE À L'ÉGARD DES FEMMES EN TEMPS DE CONFLITS ARMÉS: QUEL RÉGIME DE RESPONSABILITÉ INTERNATIONALE ?	493
Section 1. Introduction	493
Section 2. Les violences sexuelles et la responsabilité pénale internationale individuelle	496
Par. 1. Un développement notable	496
Par. 2. Les obstacles persistants	502
A. L'absence de corpus juridique indépendant	503
B. L'impunité des auteurs de crimes sexuels	505
Section 3. Les violences sexuelles et la responsabilité internationale de l'Etat	506
Par. 1. Les violences sexuelles: du « fait internationalement illicite » au crime d'Etat ?	506
Par. 2. L'interdiction du viol: une obligation internationale <i>erga omnes</i>	510

Chapitre 13 – Chapter 13

RECOGNITION AND ENFORCEMENT OF FOREIGN ORDERS AIMED TO PROTECT WOMEN AGAINST DOMESTIC VIOLENCE	515
Section 1. Introduction	515
Section 2. Global and regional protection under private international law	517
Par. 1. EU Protection Measures Regulation	518
A. The scope and structure	520
B. Automatic recognition	523
C. Issues of jurisdiction, applicable law, and non-recognition	527
D. Situations involving children.	533
Par. 2. The prospective Hague Convention on Protection Orders.	540
Section 3. Other instruments protecting women against violence	543
Par. 1. The European Union's "victims' package": a regulation and directives.	543
Par. 2. Conventions adopted within the Council of Europe.	545
A. The European Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms.	545
B. The Istanbul Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence	547
Par. 3. The CEDAW as the global document on protection of women	548
Par. 4. Other global instruments	551
Section 4. Concluding remarks	552

Chapitre 14 – Chapter 14

LE DROIT DES FEMMES À LA SANTÉ	555
Section 1. Introduction	555
Section 2. Le droit à la santé de la femme, entre égalité et non-discrimination	562
Par. 1. La centralité du principe de non-discrimination dans l'accès aux soins de santé	565
Par. 2. Le rôle libérateur de l'éducation et de l'information	570
Section 3. De la non-discrimination à la spécificité féminine	572
Par. 1. La santé des femmes entre protection et droits	573
A. Du droit à la santé « sexuelle »	579
B. Des droits et des enjeux liés à la santé « reproductive »	583
i) Le droit au « planning familial » et à la contraception : une question de définition	583
ii) Le non-droit à l'avortement	584
iii) <i>Quelle protection pour les femmes utilisatrices de biens et services de santé ?</i>	587
Par. 2. La lutte contre les violences sexistes	588
A. Les manifestations	589
B. Les solutions	593

Chapitre 15 – Chapter 15

CAN HUMAN RIGHTS PROTECT SURROGATE WOMEN IN THE CROSS-BORDER MARKET?	601
Section 1. Introduction	601
Para. 1. The global market and its participants – focus and demarcations	602
Para. 2. The need for an interdisciplinary approach	606
Section 2. Reproductive health rights and services from the perspective of international trade law	609
Para. 1. Reproductive health rights and the State	609
Para. 2. Neo-liberal governance advancing “trade rights”	613
Section 3. Challenging the general market rationales	617
Para. 1. Contextual analysis of fair distribution in lower-middle-income countries	619
Para. 2. Challenging autonomy in a patriarchal society	623
Section 4. Challenging women's rights within the conduct of the market in India	626
Para. 1. The right to receive medical treatment only upon informed consent	627
Para. 2. The right to be treated according to proper medical standard	629
Para. 3. A woman's right to decide over her body	631
Para. 4. Integrity, basic freedoms and mobility	632
Para. 5. The right to be free from stigma and discrimination	634
Section 5. Discussion and conclusions	637

Chapitre 16 – Chapter 16

RIGHTS OF WOMEN AND IMBALANCE IN SEX RATIO IN INDIA	641
Section 1. Introduction	641
Para. 1. Sex and gender	642

Section 2. The Indian legal system from past to present	643
Para. 1. Status of women in ancient India and before the British rule	644
Para. 2. Status of women in India during the British rule	647
Para. 3. Constitutional law in India	648
Para. 4. Personal laws in India	649
Para. 5. Conflicts between the personal laws	651
Section 3. Lifecycle of a girl into a woman	652
Para. 1. Birth and infancy	652
A. Prenatal period – concerns behind sex selection	653
B. Postnatal period	655
(i) Female infanticide	655
(ii) Abortion	656
Para. 2. Childhood – the risk of marriage	658
Para. 3. Adulthood – problems of dowry	658
Section 4. Effect of imbalance in sex ratio in India on societal stability	659
Section 5. International law and the Indian response	660
Para. 1. Implementation of the Convention on the Rights of the Child	660
Para. 2. Implementation of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women	662
Section 6. The role played by the judiciary in India	665
Section 7. Discussions and conclusions	667

Chapitre 17 – Chapter 17

GENDER ASPECTS OF INTER-COUNTRY CHILD ADOPTION	669
Section 1. Introduction	669
Para. 1. The topic	669
A. Inter-country child adoption	669
B. Including a gender perspective	670
C. The aim	670
D. Methods and materials	671
(i) Methods	671
(ii) Materials	671
E. Demarcations	672
Section 2. The international framework on inter-country child adoption	672
Para. 1. Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC)	673
Para. 2. Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW)	676
Para. 3. The Hague Convention on Intercountry Adoption (Hague Adoption Convention)	678
Section 3. Domestic legal regimes in inter-country child adoption arena	682
Para. 1. China	682
A. Current regulations and legal practices	683
(i) Women’s rights	683
(ii) Children’s rights	684
B. Application of the CRC	684
C. Application of the CEDAW	687
D. Application of the 1993 Hague Adoption Convention	688
Para. 2. United States	690

Section 4. Explanations, criticism and suggestions for improvement measures	691
Para. 1. Rights of girl child	691
A. Treating a girl child differently from a boy child	691
B. Explanations	694
C. Protection of the rights of the girl child	697
Para. 2. Rights of women	697
A. Treating women differently from men	698
B. Protection of the rights of women	699
Para. 3. Conclusions	699
Bibliographie sélective – Selected Bibliography	701
Table analytique des matières.	775
Table de la jurisprudence internationale.	791
Analytical Index	795
Table of International Cases	809